

## ՆԻԿՈԼԱՅ ՀՈՎՀԱՆՆԻՍՅԱՆ



Հայոց ցեղասպանությունը  
հաստատված է միջազգային  
գիտական, իրավական և  
մարդու իրավունքների  
հանրության կողմից

НИКОЛАЙ ОГАНЕСЯН

NIKOLAY HOVHANNISYAN

Армянский геноцид подтвержден  
международной научной и  
юридической общностью,  
и общностью прав человека

The armenian genocide is  
corroborated by the  
international scholarly, legal  
and human rights community

**NIKOLAY HOVHANNISYAN**

**THE ARMENIAN GENOCIDE  
IS CORROBORATED BY THE  
INTERNATIONAL SCHOLARLY, LEGAL  
AND HUMAN RIGHTS COMMUNITY**



**YEREVAN 2015**

***Editor: Professor Avetis Papazyan (USA)***

For about 50 years the author has been studying different aspects of the Armenian Genocide, as well as fundamental problems of genocides in general, in different countries of Asia, America, Africa and Europe in XX-XXI centuries.

After the investigation and detailed analysis of many primary sources, official documents and other materials, he has revised the obsolete opinions and suggested a new conceptual-strategic approach to the evaluation of the Armenian Genocide, committed in 1915 in the Ottoman Empire by the ruling Young Turk Party.

On the base of it, he came to the conclusion that:

**a/ The Armenian Genocide is already an internationally recognized genocide, corroborated and recognized by the international scholarly, legal and human rights community;**

**b/ The Ottoman Empire was not merely the first state that committed the first genocide of XX century-the Armenian Genocide, but also the first state that recognized the crime in 1919 by the Ottoman court-martial Verdict;**

**c/ Turkey is the founder of the genocide-denial industry;**

**d/ Now a new phase has begun: transition from the recognition of the Armenian Genocide to the liquidation of the heavy cosenquences of the Armenian Genocide, committed in 1915 in the Ottoman Empire.**

# **I. TRANSITION OF THE ARMENIAN GENOCIDE STUDIES FROM A SENTIMENTAL- EMOTIONAL INTO AN ACADEMIC FIELD. NEW CONCEPTUAL-STRATEGIC APPROACHES**

In the evaluation and recognition of genocides, including the Armenian Genocide-Armenocide, a turning point was the formation of genocidology in the second half of XX century as a new scientific branch within the social sciences. The foundation of International Association of Genocide Scholars (IAGS) in 1994 was also of great significance. It is the most authoritative organization in the world and major body of genocide scholars. Due to these two significant events the study of genocide was transferred from a sentimental -emotional field into a scientific field. The IAGS's first president was elected Professor Helen Fein, one of the most outstanding specialists on genocide, human rights, collective violence, author of several monographs and Director of the Institute for the Study of Genocide, City University of New York. In 1997 and 2005, IAGS as a main body of genocide scholars, unanimously recognized the Armenian Genocide.

On June 4-7, 2005, the 6th Biennial Conference of International Association of Genocide Scholars was convened in Florida, Atlantic University, USA, on "Ninety Years after the Armenian Genocide and Sixty Years after the Holocaust: The Continuing Threat and Legacy of Genocide".<sup>146</sup> It was indeed a historical event where all the outstanding specialists and scholars of the world on genocide issues participated. The 6th Biennial not only once again recognized the Armenian Genocide carried out by the Young Turk leaders in the

---

<sup>146</sup> The author participated in that Forum and was elected as a member of IAGS.

Ottoman Empire in 1915-1923, but also recognized it as the first Genocide of XX century.<sup>147</sup>

IAGS has adopted a series of documents on genocide issues: resolutions, declarations and letters addressed to the leaders of different countries. Among them, a peculiar place occupies the IAGS's letter to the Prime Minister of Turkey - Erdogan, dated on June 7, 2005, and signed by the President of IAGS, Professor Israel Charny (Israel), the first Vice-President Gregory H. Stanton (USA), the second Vice-President Linda Melvern (UK), Secretary Steven Jacobs (USA). Here are the main points of that unique and important document:

"Dear Prime Minister Erdogan: We are writing you this open letter in response to your call for "impartial study by historians" concerning the fate of the Armenian people in the Ottoman Empire during World War I. **We represent the major body of scholars who study genocide in North America and Europe.** We are concerned that calling for an impartial study of the Armenian Genocide you may not be fully aware of the extent of the scholarly and intellectual record on the Armenian Genocide and how this event conforms to the definition of the United Nations Genocide Convention. **We want to underscore that it is not just the Armenians who affirm the Armenian Genocide but it is also the overwhelming opinion of scholars who study genocide, hundreds of scholars, who have no affiliation with any government, and whose work spans many countries and nationalities and a lot of decades**".<sup>148</sup> The leaders of IAGS, the authors of the letter have mentioned that scholarly evidence reveals that on April 24, 1915, under

---

<sup>147</sup> Ninety Years after the Armenian Genocide and Sixty Years after Holocaust. 6th Biennial Conference ,

June 4-7, 2005, Florida Atlantic University, USA <http://www.instituteforthestudyofgenocide.org/oldsite/conferences/2005iags-conf2.html>

<sup>148</sup> No Place for Denial: IAGS Letter on Calls for "Impartial Study". <http://npfdinfo.blogspot.com/2005/06/-letter-for-impartial.html>

the cover of World War I, the Young Turk government of the Ottoman Empire began systematic genocide of its Armenian citizens- the unarmed Christian minority population. More than one million Armenians were exterminated by killing, starvation, torture, the rest of the Armenian population fled into permanent exile, and thus an ancient civilization was expunged from its homeland of 2500 years.<sup>149</sup> They have underlined that **"The Armenian Genocide is amply documented by thousands of official records of the United States and nations around the world including Turkey's wartime allies Germany, Austria and Hungary, by the Ottoman court-martial records, eyewitness accounts of missionaries and diplomats, the testimonies of survivors, and by decades of historical scholarship".**<sup>150</sup>

The letter has reminded the Turkish Prime Minister that when Raphael Lemkin coined the term genocide in 1944 he cited the extermination of the Armenians by Turks and the extermination of the Jews by Nazis when giving examples of what he meant by genocide. So, we have to confirm that the Armenian materials and realities on genocide together with those of the Jewish materials played a decisive and fundamental role in the formulation of the term "genocide" and essence of the genocidology.

It is obvious that a leading role belongs to scholars in affirming or denying the genocide. Their opinion, position and arguments are of great importance. Discussing the position of contemporary Turkish government towards the Armenian Genocide from this point of view, the IAGS leaders have criticized the attitude of Turkish scholars and intellectuals in their open letter to Erdogan, stating: "We would also like to note that scholars who advise your government and who are

---

<sup>149</sup> Ibid.

<sup>150</sup> Ibid.

affiliated in other ways with your institutions are not impartial. Such the so-called "scholars" serve the agenda of historical and moral obfuscation advising you and the Turkish Parliament to deny the Armenian Genocide".<sup>151</sup> In conclusion the ISAG's leaders have explained to Erdogan that **"We believe that it is in the interests of the Turkish people and their future to acknowledge the responsibility of previous government for the genocide of the Armenian people, just as the German government and people have done in the case of the Holocaust"**.<sup>152</sup> The leaders of IAGS have presented their main and fundamental conclusion on behalf of IAGS: **"The Armenian Genocide is corroborated by the International scholarly, legal and human rights community"**.<sup>153</sup> And we have to accept that it is a new conceptual approach of historical significance to the evaluation of the Armenian Genocide, based on objective and reliable studies. The unshakeable, mighty arguments of IAGS and the historical facts make any attempt to deny the Armenian Genocide, implemented by the Young Turks' government in the Ottoman Empire in 1915, baseless.

In this case, it is necessary and very important to mention the Common Public Declaration of the governments of the United Kingdom of Great Britain, France and Russia, made on 23 May, 1915, and published simultaneously the same day in their capitals-London, Paris and St. Peterbourg. They stated, "In the last months Kurds and Turkish population of Armenia were engaged in massacring the Armenians with connivance and often with the help of ottoman authorities. Such massacres took place in about the middle of April, at Erzerum, Derchan,

---

<sup>151</sup> Ibid.

<sup>152</sup> Ibid.

<sup>153</sup> Ibid.

Egin, Bitlis, Sassoun, Mush, Zeitun, and all over Cilicia".<sup>154</sup> It was mentioned in the Declaration that the inhabitants of about 100 villages near Van were all assassinated. The Armenian quarters of Van town were and are still besieged by Kurds. And the misbehavior of the ottoman government towards innocent Armenian population at Constantinople is blameworthy.<sup>155</sup> The governments of Great Britain, France and Russia declared, **"In face of these fresh crimes committed by Turkey, the allied goverments announce publicly to the Sublime Porte that they hold all the members of the Ottoman government as well as all the accessory agents personally responsible for thr Armenian massacres"**.<sup>156</sup>

This Declaration about the personal responsibility of all the members of the Ottoman government for the Armenian massacres-i.e. genocide, was a new phenomenon in the world diplomatic practice, firstly used in connection with the Armenian Tragedy of 1915. It was the first time the given government was declared responsible collectively for a crime committed in its country. In case of the Armenian Massacres/Genocide in the Ottoman Empire, the Young Turk government was declared guilty by Great Britain, France and Russia. It was a very serious accusation. And it is worthy of note that the new conceptual approach was demonstrated by France, Great Britain and Russia not after the World War I, but during the war time, which raises the political significance of the mentioned Declaration.

This Declaration, as an official Document, later played its positive role in the processes of International recognition of the Armenian Genocide.

---

<sup>154</sup> British Documents . From Foreign Office Press Office For Publication in Monday Morning Papers (23 May 1915).

<sup>155</sup> Ibid.

<sup>156</sup> Ibid.



## **II. THE OTTOMAN EMPIRE COMMITTING THE ARMENIAN GENOCIDE WAS THE FIRST STATE THAT RECOGNIZED THE ARMENIAN GENOCIDE**

A new conceptual approach is to be used to the question of recognition of the Armenian Genocide by the Turkish state, too. Which was the first state that officially recognized the Armenian Genocide? It is usually said Uruguay to be the first state, which recognized the Armenian Genocide in 1965. But this point of view needs a revision.

The Armenian Genocide was carried out in the Ottoman Empire, in the Ottoman state in 1915, and the Ottoman state was the first state of the world that recognized the Armenian Genocide in 1919. And it was done not by a declaration, but legally, according to the juridical norms and legitimate actions, by the Verdict of the Ottoman court-martial, established by the fetwa (decree) of the Ottoman legitimate sultan Wahieddin VI on 8 March 1919.

It is well known that after the defeat of the Ottoman Empire in World War I and flight of the Young Turk criminal leaders - Talaat, Enver, Cemal, Nazim, Shaqir Behaeddin and others from Turkey, Ahmed Tefik pasha formed a new government, which took a decision in November 1918 on trial of the leaders of the Young Turk party "Ittihad ve Terakki", the Ottoman government and Parliament. The new prime minister (Grand Vezir) Damad Ferid pasha, successor of Ahmed Tefik pasha, also pursued the case. He qualified the treatment of the Armenians during the First World War as "A crime that drew the revulsion of the entire humankind"<sup>157</sup> By the decree of the legitimate sultan of the Ottoman Empire Wahieddin (1918-1922) on March 8, 1919, three legitimate courts-martial were established the members of

---

<sup>157</sup> Genocide 1915 info-the Armenian Genocide , [http:// www.genocide 1915, info/quotes/](http://www.genocide1915.info/quotes/)

which were also appointed by sultan. According to his decree, the First court-martial tried the case of the top leadership of the Young Turk party. The trial began on April 28, 1919, in Constantinople, and ended on June 26, 1919. The court-martial Verdict was delivered and announced on July 5, 1919. The Second court-martial tried the case of regional Young Turk party leaders and other regional officials. As for the Third court-martial, it tried the case of organizers and executors of deportation and massacres of the Armenians in the regions of Yozghat, Trapizon, Buyuq Derey and Kharberd.

By the Verdict of the First court-martial all the top leaders of "Ittihad ve Terakki" - Talaat, Enver, Cemal, Nazim, Shaqir Behaeddin, Sayid Halim, Azmi and others, 11 men, were sentenced to death. They were sentenced to death for committing two crimes. First, for involving the Ottoman Empire in World War I without discussing the issue in the Parliament and obtaining its consent for the action as it was required by the Ottoman Constitution. Second, for the crime against the Armenians, for their mass killings, tortures, starvation and deportation, annihilation; a scientific definition of the crime is the Armenian Genocide. In the indictment, it was stated: "The Young Turks started to exterminate the people, plunder, set their property on fire and harry many of them to death. Though the arrow of terror was basically directed against the Armenians, nevertheless other peoples suffered too."<sup>158</sup> The crimes committed during the deportation of the Armenians in different times and places, and also a special investigation of each of those crimes according to the law, have shown that they were not of limited or local character, but willful, deliberate actions realized by verbal instructions and secret orders of the "Special center", consisting of the abovementioned persons. It has been proved

---

<sup>158</sup> Greeks, Assyrians, Arabs and others among them-N. H.

beyond the shadow of doubt that those massacres took place by the direct orders and awareness of Talaat, Enver and Cemal beys".<sup>159</sup>

So the Verdict of the Ottoman legitimate court-martial asserted by force of law that the Armenian Genocide was not an accidental event, but a criminal action, prepared beforehand and implemented according to the Young Turks' program to turn the Ottoman Empire into ethnically clean, pure Turkish state. And the Genocide of the Armenians, Greeks and Assyrians in the Ottoman Empire is necessary to regard in that context and as a crime against the mankind.

So it is not sufficient to state that the Armenian genocide was the first genocide implemented by the Young Turks in the Ottoman Empire in 1915. Taking into account the records of the Ottoman courts-martial in 1919 and its Verdict, we have to use a new conceptual strategic approach and confirm the fact of the recognition of the Armenian Genocide by the Ottoman Empire.

**So we have to state that the Ottoman Empire was not only the first state that carried out the first Genocide-the Armenian Genocide in 1915, in XX century, but also the first state, which recognized the Armenian Genocide in 1919.**

In fact it was corroborated by the three main leaders of Young Turks and wartime Ottoman Empire - Enver Pasha, Talaat Pasha and Cemal Pasha.

**Enver Pasha**, the Minister of War of the Ottoman Empire publicly declared on 19 May 1916: "The Ottoman Empire should be cleansed of the Armenians and Lebanese. We have destroyed the former by sword, we shall destroy the latter through starvation"<sup>160</sup>. In reply to USA Ambassador Morgenthau, who deplored the massacres against

---

<sup>159</sup> The Armenian Genocide according to the Documents of Young Turks Trial. Preface, Translation, Commentaries by A.H. Papazyan, Yerevan, 1988.

<sup>160</sup> Armenian Genocide Quotes. Turkish Quotes. Enver Pasha [http:// www.armeniapedia.org](http://www.armeniapedia.org)

[/index.php?title=Armenian\\_Genocide\\_Quotes#Mustafa\\_22Ataturk22\\_Kemal](http://index.php?title=Armenian_Genocide_Quotes#Mustafa_22Ataturk22_Kemal)

Armenians and attributed them to irresponsible subalterns and underlings in the distant provinces, Enver said: "You are greatly mistaken. We have this country absolutely under our control. I have no desire to shift the blame onto our underlings and I am entirely willing to accept responsibility for everything that has taken place"<sup>161</sup>.

According to the opinion of the Prime Minister and Minister of Interior of the Ottoman Empire, **Talaat Pasha**, which he expressed in a conversation with Dr. Mordtmann of the German Embassy in June 1915, "Turkey is taking advantage of the war in order to thoroughly liquidate ( grundlich aufzaumen) its internal foes, i.e. the indigenous Christians, without being thereby disturbed by foreign intervention"<sup>162</sup>. When the German diplomat persistently brought up the Armenian question in 1918, Talaat said "with a smile": "What on earth do you want? **The question is settled. There are no more Armenians**"<sup>163</sup>".

And finally, here is the opinion of the Minister of Navy of the Ottoman Empire, **Cemal Pasha**, who said to a German officer during the deportation of the Armenians in Kharberd vilayat: "I am ashamed of my nation (Ich schame mich fur meine Nation)"<sup>164</sup>. He also confirmed that the Minister of Interior of Turkey Talaat Pasha publicly declared on March 15 that on the basis of calculations performed by Ministry experts, "800,000 Armenian deportees were killed ...they concealed the real number with an intention to cleanse their bloody past"<sup>165</sup>.

We would also like to represent the point of view of the Grand Vezir-Prime Minister of the Ottoman Empire Damad Ferid Pasha. He was the second Grand Vezir, after the defeat of the Ottoman Empire in

---

<sup>161</sup> Ibid.

<sup>162</sup> Armenian Genocide Quotes. Turkish Quotes. Talat Pasha

<http://www.armeniapedia.org/.....>

<sup>163</sup> Ibid.

<sup>164</sup> Armenian Genocide Quotes. Turkish Quotes. Cemal Pasha <http://www.armeniapedia.org/....>

<sup>165</sup> Ibid.

the World War I, succeeding Ahmed Tefik Pasha, when courts-martial's Verdict of Turkey accused the Young Turk top leaders for committing the Armenian Genocide. Prime Minister **Damad Ferid Pasha** "Described the treatment of the Armenians as a crime that drew the revulsion of the entire mankind"<sup>166</sup>.

The abovementioned materials are very unique documents, in fact a recognition by the three criminal rulers of wartime Ottoman Empire of the fact that according to a preconcerted plan they carried out the Armenian genocide, cleansed the Ottoman Empire of the Armenians and other Christians, taking advantage of the First World War. Those exclusively important documents affirm that Enver, Talaat and Cemal villy-nilly recognized the Armenian genocide or according to the formulation of the Prime Minister of the Ottoman Empire Talaat Pasha, "The question is settled. There are no more Armenians".

Even Mustafa Kemal, the founder of the Turkish Republic in 1923, recognized that historical fact. In an interview published on August 1, 1926 in the "Los Angeles Examiner", talking about the former Young Turks in his country, **Mustafa Kemal said, "Those left-overs of the former Young Turk Party, who should have been brought to account for ruthlessly driving en masse the millions of our Christian subjects from their homes and massacring them, have been very restive under the Republic rule"**<sup>167</sup>. To my opinion this kind of accusations are recognition and accusation of the Armenian genocide, committed by the Young Turks in the Ottoman Empire.

Speaking about the massacres of Christian subjects, Mustafa Kemal, first of all meant the Armenians, for whose deportation and massacre the Young Turks should have been brought to account.

---

<sup>166</sup> Armenian Genocide Quotes. Turkish Quotes. Grand Vezir Damad Ferid Pasha <http://www.org/...>

<sup>167</sup> Armenian Genocide Quotes. World Figures. Mustafa "Ataturk" Kemal [http://www.armeniapedia.org/index.php?title=Armenian\\_Genocide\\_Quotes\\_22Ataturk22\\_Kemal](http://www.armeniapedia.org/index.php?title=Armenian_Genocide_Quotes_22Ataturk22_Kemal)

So, the confession of the three main rulers of the Ottoman Empire, the Ottoman courts-martial records and its Verdict legally, by virtue of law, implicitly confirm that the Ottoman state committed the Armenian genocide and it was also the first state that recognized the Armenian genocide. And it is an unforgivable historical blunder to state that a/ Turkey has not recognized the Armenian genocide, b/ she must recognize the Armenian genocide and.c/ Uruguay is the first state that has recognized the Armenian Genocide.

The Ottoman Empire existed until 1923, when it was proclaimed as a republic. The Turkish Republic is the successor of the Ottoman Empire but she has not recognized the Armenian Genocide until now. At the same time, she has not and cannot abrogate the Verdict of the Ottoman court-martial, 1919. She does not deny the fact of deportation of Armenians too. According to the principles of the genocidology, deportation is an organic part of genocide. There is no genocide without deportation. It is confirmed not only by the events of the Armenian Genocide, but also by the Jewish Holocaust and all other genocides that have happened in Asia, Europe and Africa. Thus, the Turkish government has partially accepted the historical reality of the Armenian Genocide.

So, we consider, that the Turkish Republic must not recognize the Armenian genocide, but re-recognize it, which once was done by its predecessor-Ottoman Empire. So now, the main demand to the Turkish Republic is just what has been written in the letter of the International Association of Genocide Scholars to the Prime Minister of Turkey Erdogan: "To acknowledge the responsibility of the previous government for the genocide of the Armenian people, just as the German government and people have done in the case of the Holocaust"<sup>168</sup>.

---

<sup>168</sup> No Place for Denial. IAGS Letter on calls for "Impartial Study".

### **III. RECOGNITION OF THE ARMENIAN GENOCIDE AT INSTITUTIONAL LEVEL**

To have a more complete picture and general idea of the International recognition of the Armenian genocide, it is also necessary to review certain main and principal International documents, adopted by different state bodies, legislative powers, legal institutions of the European, Asian and American countries, as well as international nongovernmental, public organizations, associations, committees, etc.

For this purpose, we have divided those documents and materials into two categories: a/ documents adopted at an institutional level, and

b/ documents adopted at a level of "Nongovernmental Organizations"-societies, associations, committees, councils, etc.

The Armenian Genocide has been condemned and recognized by International community at an institutional level. By saying an "Institutional level", we mean state, governmental and legislative bodies, heads of states and governments and other responsible statesmen, authoritative international organizations, etc.<sup>169</sup>

#### **1. The Armenian Genocide has been recognized by the following states.**

Up to this day, the Armenian genocide has been recognized and condemned by the following countries:

1. Ottoman Empire-1919, A Verdict of the Ottoman court-martial, established by the decree of the Ottoman Sultan;
2. Uruguay-1965, Senate and House of Representatives Resolution, followed by a Law in 2004;
3. Cyprus- 1982, Parliamentary Resolution;

---

<sup>169</sup> Armenian Genocide- Recognition of the Armenian Genocide-[http:// genocide.am/article/recognition\\_of\\_the\\_armenian\\_genocide.html](http://genocide.am/article/recognition_of_the_armenian_genocide.html)

4. Armenia-1988, the Resolution of Supreme Soviet;
5. Argentina-1993, Senate Resolution, followed by a Law in 2004;
6. Russia-1995, State Duma Resolution;
7. Greece-1996, Parliamentary Resolution and Law on Punishment for denial of genocides as a felony and criminal offence in 2014;
8. Lebanon- 1997, Resolution of the Chamber of Deputies;
9. Canada- House of Commons Resolutions were adopted in 1996, 2004; and Senate in 2002;
10. Belgium- 1998, Senate Resolution;
11. France-Parliamentary Resolutions were adopted in 1998, 2000, followed by a Law in 2001;
12. Sweden-2000, Parliamentary Report and Resolution of Riksdag in 2010;
13. Vatican - in 2000;
14. Italia-2000, Chamber of Deputies Resolution;
15. Switzerland-2003, National Council Resolution and Law on Punishment for denial of genocides as a felony and criminal offence;
16. Slovakia-2004, A Resolution and Law on Punishment for denial of of genocides as a felony and criminal offence;
17. The Netherlands -2004, Parliamentary Resolution;
18. Poland-2004, Seim Resolition;
19. Venezuela-2005, Parliamentary Resolution;
20. Germany-2005, Bundestag Resolution;
21. Lithuania-2005, Parliamentary Resolution;
22. Chile-2007, Parliamentary Resolution.<sup>170</sup>
23. Bolivia-2014; Parliamentary and Senate Resolution.

---

<sup>170</sup> Recognition of the Armenian Genocide. List of Countries. [http://genocide.am/article/recognition\\_of\\_the\\_armenian\\_genocide.html](http://genocide.am/article/recognition_of_the_armenian_genocide.html). See also: N. Hovhannisyan, Armenocide-Recognised Genocide, Yerevan, 2010, p.176- 177.



23 states – in total, of which - 14 European, 3 Asian and 6 American states. Two states-**Russian Federation and France, are Permanent Members of the Security Council of the United Nations Organization, and Vatican is the center of the Catholic World.**

The recognition has been realized by the Verdict of court- martial (Ottoman Empire), by the resolutions of legislative powers - Senates, Parliaments, State Duma, Bundestag, Riksdag, Seims. Uruguay, Argentina and France, besides the recognition of Armenian Genocide, have also adopted corresponding Laws. **Switzerland, Slovakia and Greece, besides the recognition of the Armenian Genocide, have adopted Laws on punishment for denial of genocides, including the Armenian Genocide, as a felony or a criminal offence.** And these Laws are active Laws. For example, on march 8, 2007, Turkish nationalist Dogu Perincek was the first person convicted for denying the Armenian genocide by the Swiss district court in Lousanne. Perincek appealed the Verdict but the conviction was upheld by the Swiss Federal Supreme Court on December 12, 2007<sup>171</sup>.

## **2. Recognition of the Armenian Genocide by the bicameral legislative branch of the European Union. European Parliament and Council of Europe**

The role of the European Union in the process of the recognition of the Armenian Genocide is exclusively important. Now this organization unites 28 European memeber states. It has its own structures, including executive and legislative bodies. The European Parliament and Council of Europe form the bicameral legislative branch of the EU.

One of the legislative branches of the EU- the European Parliament, was founded in 1979. It includes more than 700 members.

---

<sup>171</sup> Recognition of the Armenian Genocide. International Organizations.[http://en.wiki.org/wiki/Recognition\\_of\\_the\\_Armenian\\_Genocide](http://en.wiki.org/wiki/Recognition_of_the_Armenian_Genocide).

On June 18, 1987, it adopted a Resolution on the recognition of the Armenian Genocide, stating that the European Parliament:

" Convinced that the recognition of the identity of the Armenian people in Turkey as an ethnic, cultural, linguistic and religious minority, follows on from the recognition of its own history,

- whereas the Armenian side regards these events (i.e. massacres of Armenians in Ottoman Empire in 1915-N.H.) as planned genocide within the meaning of the 1948 UN Convention,

- whereas the Turkish state rejects the charge of genocide as unfounded,

- whereas, to date, the Turkish Government, by refusing to recognize the genocide of 1915, continues to deprive the Armenian people of the right of their own history,

- whereas the historically proven Armenian genocide has so far neither been the object of political condemnation nor received due compensation,

**Believes that the tragic events in 1915-1917 involving the Armenians living in the territory of the Ottoman Empire constitute genocide within the meaning of the convention on the prevention and the punishment of the crime of genocide adopted by the UN General Assembly on 9 December 1948".<sup>172</sup>**

As for the other branch of the European Parliament- Council of Europe, it was founded in 1949. It has 47 member states with 800 million citizens. The Republic of Armenia became a member of it on 25 January, 2001. The Council of Europe puts a particular emphasis on legal standards, human rights democratic development, the rule of law and cultural co-operation. The Council of Europe recognized the Armenian Genocide on May 14, 2001, by written Declaration, stating that:

---

<sup>172</sup> European Parliament Resolution on a Political Solution to the Armenian Question. Doc. A2-33/87. June 18, 1987.

"Commemorating today the anniversary of the first genocide of the 20th century-the Armenian genocide- and paying tribute to the memory of its victims;

Condemning the manifestations of the crime of genocide as crimes perpetrated against humanity;

Considering that the unequivocal repudiation of the acts of genocide is a necessary means to help prevent its recurrence;

Taking note of the fact that various European institutions, parliaments of a number of member countries of the Council of Europe have adopted resolutions and statements recognising the Armenian genocide, in the case of the national assembly of France a law;

Considering that the recognition by the international community of the Armenian genocide will eventually allow the Turkish authorities a similar admission , and as a result will lead to improved relations between Armenia-Turkey, and thus, contribute the regional peace, security and stability,

The undersigned members of the Assembly, appeal to all the members of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe to take the necessary steps for the recognition of the genocide perpetrated by the Ottoman Empire against the Armenians at the beginning of the 20th century"<sup>173</sup>.

So, we have to state that the characteristics of the Armenian Genocide, given by the Resolutions of the two EU parliamentary branches, are quite correct, clear and convincing. The two very important official documents of the European Union once more confirm that the Armenian Genocide was the first genocide of the 20th century , a crime against humanity, and Turkey has no choice but to accept the reality of those historical facts.

---

<sup>173</sup> Council of Europe. Parliamentary Assembly. Doc. 9056, 2nd edition . Recognition of the Armenian Genocide Written Declaration No 320.

The conclusions of the two Resolutions, adopted by the European Parliament and the Council of Europe, have changed very positively the international political atmosphere around the question of the Armenian Genocide, and gave a new and impulse to the processes of its recognition.

### **3. Mercosur. Its Parliament and the Armenian Cause**

Mercosur (Spanish:Mercado Comun del Sur)- Southern Common Market, is a Regional Trade Organization, founded in 1991, when Argentina, Brazil, Paraguay and Uruguay signed a Regional Trade Agreement. On June 17, 2006, Venezuela signed a membership agreement, while Bolivia, Chile, Colombia, Ecuador and Peru have an associate membership status. As for Mexico, it has a status of an observer. The Mercosur's purpose is to promote free trade and fluid movement of goods, people and currency. But it is not indifferent towards the International political affairs.

The Summit of the Presidents of the mentioned states, convened in 2004, decided to found a Parliament of Mercosur, consisting of 18 representatives of each member country.

This Parliament on November 24, 2007, adopted a Resolution on the Armenian genocide, entitled, "Mercosur Parliament recognises and condemns the Armenian Genocide". Here is its full text:

"Legislative representatives from four country members, Argentina, Brazil, Paraguay and Uruguay condemn the Armenian Genocide perpetrated by the Ottoman Empire which took 1,5 million lives, from 1915 to 1923".<sup>174</sup>

---

<sup>174</sup> Mercosur Parliament Recognises and Condemns the Armenian Genocide. Armenian Genocide Information Center(UK) <http://www.armenian-genocide.info/2007/11/mercotur-parliament-recognises-and.html>

The Mercosur resolution expressed 'its support for the Armenian Cuase and called on all the countries to recognize the Genocide".<sup>175</sup>

The resolution was introduced by the representatives of Argentina and Uruguay and after approval by the Human Rights Committee, **was passed by the entire Mercosur Parliament**<sup>176</sup>.

#### **4. Recognition of the Armenian Genocide by legislative and governmental bodies of self-governing administrative territories, regions and provinces**

During our research work on this issue, it became clear that alongside with the Recognition of the Armenian Genocide by 23 Asian, European and American states, two parliamentary branches of the European Union and the Mercosur Parliament, the Armenian Genocide was also recognized by the legislative and executive powers of autonomous entities and local parliaments of several administrative-territorial entities.

The peculiarity of this phenomenon lies in the fact that the legislative powers of those regions and provinces recognized the Armenian Genocide regardless of the fact whether the Parliament of the "mother" country had recognized the Armenian genocide or not.

The Armenian Genocide was recognized by:

##### **I.Australia**

1. Parliament of **New South Wales Province**- in 2007;
2. Parliament of **South Australia Province**-in 2009;

They condemned the genocide and called on the Australian Government to recognize the Armenian Genocide.

##### **II. Brazilia**

- 3.State Assembly of **Sao Paulo State**-in 2003;

---

<sup>175</sup> Ibid.

<sup>176</sup> Ibid.

4. **Legislative Council of Ceara State**-in 2006;
5. **Legislative Power of Parana State** -in 2013;

### **III. Canada**

6. **Legislative Power of Quebec Province**-in 2001;
7. **Legislative Power of Ontario Province** -in 2001.

They recognized the Armenian Genocide independently of the Canadian Federal Government.

### **IV. Spain**

8. **Basque Country Parliament**-in 2007;
9. **Catalonia Parliament**-in 2010;
10. **Balearic Islands Parliament**-in 2010;

### **V. Italy**

11. **Legislative Body of Lombardia Province**

### **VI. Great Britain**

12. **National Assembly of Wales**-in 2002; **Presiding Officer of the National Assembly**-in 2007; **First Minister of Wales** Carvin Jones-in 2010;
13. **Lagislative Body of Northern Ireland**;
14. **Scottish Parliament**-in 2013;

### **VII. Switzerland**

15. **Bern Canton's Legislative Body**.

### **VIII. 16. Crimea's Supreme Council**- in 2005<sup>177</sup>

So the Armenian Genocide was recognized by the legislative bodies and governments of 16 autonomous, administrative-territorial, regional entities and provinces, though some of their "mother" countries, as Australia, Brazilia, Great Britain and Spain have not yet recognized the Armenian tragedy as a Genocide.

---

<sup>177</sup>See Recognition of the Armenian Genocid. [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/recognition\\_of\\_the\\_Armenian\\_Genocide](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/recognition_of_the_Armenian_Genocide); First Minister of Wales recognizes the Armenian Genocide <http://efjd.eu/spip.php?breve2353>; Petition on Armenian Genocide Recognition Received the Support of Majority of Scottish Parliament.

The most ridiculous situation is connected with Great Britain. Three principal countries of the United Kingdom- Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland, have already formally recognized the Armenian Genocide. Only the fourth country-England, avoids the recognition. In this case, the Government of Great Britain does not express the will of the whole country, the political interests of all its parts, but only the interests of one country-England, which is nonsense, though the Government of the United Kingdom, as it was mentioned above, together with the Governments of France and Russia condemned the crimes against the Armenians in the Ottoman Empire in 1915, declaring that all the members of the Turkish government are responsible for massacres of the Armenians.

There is also another form of recognition of the Armenian Genocide. We mean the municipalities of many cities in different countries of the world, such as Bulgaria, France, Greece, Lebanon, Italy, Cyprus, Wales, Argentina, Syria etc. The Armenian genocide has been recognized by municipalities of Plovdiv, Burgas, Ruse, Stara Zagora, Bazardzik of Bulgaria, Deir al- Zor, Haleb of Syria, Cardiff of Wales, Milano of Italy, Valencia of Spain, Quindios of Colombia, which has been renamed into "Armenia" in memory of the victims of the Armenian Genocide, and many other municipalities.

## **5. Recognition of the Armenian Genocide by Legislative Bodies of the USA States**

As we know the USA is a federal state and consists of 50 states. They have their own local legislative, executive and judicial bodies; have a right of passing laws and adopting legal resolutions. And its evidence is the recognition of the Armenian Genocide by 43 American states, though the USA federal executive and legislative powers still have not done it.

US 43 states, out of 50, have already recognized the Armenian Genocide as of May 2013, by their legislative bodies. Bellow we represent the list of those states:

- |                     |                              |
|---------------------|------------------------------|
| 1.Alaska,           | 23.Nebraska,                 |
| 2.Arizona,          | 24.Nevada,                   |
| 3.Arkansas,         | 25.New Hampshire,            |
| 4.California,       | 26.New Jersey,               |
| 5.Colorado,         | 27.New Mexico,               |
| 6.Connecticut,      | 28.New York,                 |
| 7.Delaware,         | 29.North Carolina,           |
| 8.Florida,          | 30.North Dakota,             |
| 9.Georgia,          | 31.Ohio,                     |
| 10.Hawaii,          | 32.Oklahoma,                 |
| 11.Idaho,           | 33.Oregon,                   |
| 12.Illinois,        | 34.Pennsylvania,             |
| 13.Kansas,          | 35.Rhode Island,             |
| 14. Kentucky,       | 36.South Carolina,           |
| 15.Louisiana,       | 37.Tennessee,                |
| 16.Maine,           | 38. Texas,                   |
| 17.Maryland,        | 39.Utah,                     |
| 18.Massachussettes, | 40.Vermont ,                 |
| 19.Michigan,        | 41.Virginia,                 |
| 20.Minnesota,       | 42.Washington                |
| 21.Missouri,        | 43.Wisconsin. <sup>178</sup> |
| 22.Montana,         |                              |

Only 7 states- Alabama, Indiana, Iowa, Mississippi, South Dakota, West Virginia and Wyoming, remain out of the process of recognition of the crime against the Armenians in the Ottoman Empire. But it does not change the very impressive general picture. So the overwhelming

---

<sup>178</sup> International Affirmation of the Armenian Genocide. States and Provinces . United States [http:// www.armenian- genocide.org/ /current\\_category.11/affirmation\\_list.html](http://www.armenian-genocide.org/current_category.11/affirmation_list.html)



majority of the US states, about 83 percent, including all important and leading states, which compose the political, economic, military, scientific and cultural portrait of the contemporary United States of America, have already recognized the Armenian Genocide, condemned the Ottoman Young Turk leaders' criminal actions and denial policy of the modern Turkish government.

It demonstrates the large scale of International recognition of the First Genocide of XX century -the Armenian Genocide.

#### **6. A New Conceptual Approach to the Evaluation of the Attitude of the USA Presidents and High Rank Leaders of other Countries towards the Question of the Armenian Genocide**

The genocide scholars usually pay great attention to the attitude of the USA and other countries heads towards the recognition of the Armenian Genocide. It is one of the disputable problems. But it does not mean that this question should be turned into a basic or corner-stone question in recognition of the Armenian Genocide or its significance should be exaggerated. It also requires a new conceptual approach.

When we speak about the attitude of the USA Presidents, first of all we mean four presidents-Woodrow Wilson, Jimmy Carter, Ronald Reagan and Barak Obama. Many official documents and materials confirm that they have recognized the Armenian Genocide.

President Woodrow Wilson, the USA president of 1912-1920, was the first American head of State who recognized the Armenian Genocide, though the term of Genocide had not yet been invented at that time. Wilson and the members of his team usually used the terms "Armenian massacres". It was also used the term "Annihilation of the Armenians". Those two terms are equal by their meaning to the term of genocide, invented in 1944 by Raphael Lemkin. Woodrow Wilson did

his best to make the Young Turk leaders stop the massacres and annihilation of the Armenians. But unfortunately he failed.

The second president who recognized the Armenian Genocide was Jimmy Carter. He was the USA president in 1976-1980. On May 16, 1978, he made the following statement: **"It is generally not known in the world that, in the years preceding 1916, there was a concerted effort made to eliminate all the Armenian people, probably one of the greatest tragedies that ever befell any group. And there weren't any Nuerenberg trials".**<sup>179</sup> Despite the fact that the term of Genocide was not used in that announcement, Carter's formulation **"there was a concerted efforts made to eliminate all the Armenian people"** is fully coinciding with the definition of "genocide", given by its author - Raphael Lemkin, and accepted by the world community. Jimmy Carter's observation on **"There weren't any Nuerenberg trials"** in case of the Armenian Genocide., is also very important and valuable.

As for the third President Ronald Reagan, President of the USA in 1980-1988, he formulated his position very clearly, using the "genocide" term. In his Proclamation, April 22, 1981, during the Remembrance Days of the Victims of the Holocaust, he declared: "Like the genocide of the Armenians before it, and the genocide of the Cambodians- which followed it - and like too many other such persecutions of too many other peoples- the lessons of the Holocaust must never be forgotten".<sup>180</sup> In this case, it is necessary to pay attention at two important circumstances. Firstly, President Reagan recognized not only the Armenian Genocide as a Genocide, but also admitted, that it was the first genocide, stating **"Like the Genocide of the Armenians before it"**, i.e. before the Jewish Holocaust. In this case we would like to

---

<sup>179</sup> Armenian Genocide Quotes. Jimmy Carter May 16, 1978. White House Ceremony [http://www.armeniapedia.org/index.php?title=Armenian\\_Genocide\\_Quotes](http://www.armeniapedia.org/index.php?title=Armenian_Genocide_Quotes)

Mustafa\_22Ataturk22\_Kemal

<sup>180</sup> Ronald Reagan. Proclamation 4838 of April 22, 1981. Days of Remembrance of Victims of the Holocaust.

underline that as Professor of Hebrew University, Jerusalem, Franklin Littell mentioned, "After the genocidal actions of the governments of Cambodia, Sudan, Burundi, Rwanda and Bosnia, we may speak of the XX century, which began with the genocide of the Armenians, as of the Era Genocide".<sup>181</sup> Secondly, President Reagan examined the Jewish Holocaust in the context of genocides, in the context of the Armenian genocide, implemented before the Holocaust, and in the context of genocide in Cambodia and other countries after the Holocaust. It is very important from point of view of evaluating the chain of genocides and their links. It also helps to have a correct understanding about the dangers of genocide as a dangerous phenomenon for the whole mankind.

After the President Ronald Reagan, when he was succeeded by George Bush Elder, Bill Clinton and George Bush Younger, all of them, before elections as presidents, were declaring that they would recognize the Armenian Genocide. But after occupying the chair of the President in the White House, they broke their promises, refused to recognize the Armenian Genocide and never pronounced the words "Armenian Genocide".

As for the position of the USA today's President Barack Obama, here the problem is a little different. Barack Obama also before becoming the president of the USA, being a Senator, accepted that the tragedy of the Armenians in 1915 was genocide. On January 19, 2008, Senator Barack Obama released a statement: "Two years ago, I criticized the Secretary of State for firing the U.S. Ambassador to Armenia John Evans, after he properly used the term "genocide" to describe Turkey's slaughter of thousands of Armenians starting in 1915. I shared with Secretary Rice my firmly held conviction that the

---

<sup>181</sup> See. N.Hovhannisyan, The Armenian Genocide. Armenocide the Most Genocidal Genocide. In Ten languages of the World. In English, French, Russian, German, Turkish, Japanese, Hungarian, Armenian, Arabic, Persian, Yerevan, 2009, p. 574.

Armenian genocide is not an allegation, a personal opinion, or a point of view but rather a widely documented fact supported by an overwhelming body of historical evidence. The facts are undeniable. An official policy that calls on diplomats to distort the historical facts is an untenable policy. As a senator, I strongly support the passage of the Armenian Genocide Resolution (H.Res.106 and Sen. Res. 106), and as a President I will recognize the Armenian Genocide".<sup>182</sup> On April 24, 2009, Barack Obama as the USA President stated: "I have consistently stated my own view of what occurred in 1915, and my view of that history has not changed. My interest remains the achievement of a full, frank and just acknowledgement of the facts".<sup>183</sup>

In his Statement of 2009 and also of 2012, President Obama preferred to use the Armenian formulation "Mec Yeghern", which means "Great Tragedy" instead of "genocide", mentioning that "Mec Yeghern will continue to live in our Memory".<sup>184</sup> I think that the using of the Armenian term "Mec Yeghern" was not by chance. It was a well-considered decision, a wise step by the President Barack Obama. He knew very well that the Armenians themselves had been using the term "Mec Yeghern" i.e. -"Great Tragedy" for the tragic events of 1915 before the invention of the "Genocide" term by Raphael Lemkin, as well as after that. Even now, in Armenian families "Mec Yeghern" term is used not only by the old generation, who were eyewitnesses of the Armenian Genocide, but also by the young generation. When President Obama used the "Mec Yeghern" term, there was a hope that thus he opened the doors for a compromised decision, which could be acceptable for the Armenians who had been using that definition for about a century, and would satisfy their demands, on one hand, and on

---

<sup>182</sup> Barack Obama on the Importance of US-Armenia Relations [http://www.barackobama.com/2008/01/19/barack\\_obama\\_on\\_the\\_importance.php](http://www.barackobama.com/2008/01/19/barack_obama_on_the_importance.php)

<sup>183</sup> Statement of President Barack Obama on Armenian Remembrance Day, 2009. The White House Office of the Press Secretary, April 24, 2009.

<sup>184</sup> Ibid.

the other hand would be acceptable for the contemporary Turkish government too. But unfortunately it did not happen. The Armenians, in particular the Armenian Diaspora, mainly of America, rejected it and did not regard "Mes Yeghern" as a synonym to the genocide. The position of Turkish side also was negative.

In our opinion, "Mec Yeghern" and "Armenian Genocide" are synonyms from historical and substantial aspects.

So, we can affirm that the four American presidents have used three terms for definition of the Armenian tragedy of 1915- "Annihilation of the Armenian people" by Woodrow Wilson, "Armenian Genocide" by Jimmy Carter and Ronald Reagan, and "Mec Yeghern" by Barack Obama.

It is interesting to note that the Jews also use three terms for the Holocaust-"Genocide", "Holocaust" and "Shoah" or "Ha'shoah".<sup>185</sup>

So, we have to conclude that the four American presidents, though using different terms and formulations, have anyway recognized the Armenian Genocide.

Certain steps were also taken by the American Congress for the recognition of the Armenian Genocide. On March 4, 2010, the USA House Committee on Foreign Affairs passed a Resolution describing the murders of the Armenians by Turkish forces during World War I as genocide. The Resolution called on President Barack Obama to ensure that "US foreign policy reflects an understanding of the 'genocide' and to label the World War I killings as such in his annual statement on the issue".<sup>186</sup> It is significant that even those congressmen who voted against the Resolution didn't deny the Armenian genocide. Their argument was connected with the timing, i.e. the moment was not suitable for passing

---

<sup>185</sup> The Holocaust [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The\\_Holocaust](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Holocaust).

<sup>186</sup> [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Recognition\\_of\\_the\\_Armenian\\_Genocide](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Recognition_of_the_Armenian_Genocide)

a favourable Resolution for the recognition of the Armenian Genocide.<sup>187</sup>

Many high-ranking officials, among them presidents of certain states, also have recognized the Armenian Genocide in a peculiar manner, even when the given state has not yet officially accepted that fact. The best example is the Islamic Republic of Iran.

On the eve of overthrow of monarchy of shah Mohammed Pehlevy in Iran, many Armenians of Iran, left Iran and found a shelter in Lebanon. They were affraid of possible victory of Islamic movement and establishment of radical Islamic regime in Iran. I was in Lebanon at that time. I was sent to Lebanon by the government of Armenia with the consent of Moscow to offer political support to the Armenian community of Lebanon, which had been involved in the civil war in Lebanon since 1975. The Iranian Armenians asked me whether the goverment of Armenia could help them to return home, i.e. Iran, or not. I informed the Armenian government about it and received an assignment to do everything for the safely return of Iranian Armenians to Iran. I met with Husayn Husayny, Speaker of the Lebanese Parliament, and one of the supporters of Ayatollah Khomainy, with whom we had contacted during the civil war in Lebanon on different issues, and asked him to help us. I knew that he was in close relations with Khomainy. He promised me to do his best. And indeed, that issue was discussed, and Mustafa Chamran, who soon became the Minister of Defense of Islamic Republic of Iran and Chairman of Revolutionary Council of IRI, was sent to Lebanon with a message from Khomainy. We met with him at Husayn Husayni's home in Beirut and he passed me the following message of Ayatollah Khomayni: «We know very well the history of Armenians, including their tragic pages. Iran is not that state and the Persians are not that people who will organize a new Armenian

---

<sup>187</sup> N. Hovhannisyan, *Armenocide- a Recognized Genocide*, p. 180-181.

genocide. The Armenians are our brothers»<sup>188</sup>. After that the Armenians returned to Iran.

Continuing this theme, we should also mention that later, in 2004, when the president of the Islamic Republic of Iran Muhammad Khatami officially visited Armenia, he visited the Memorial Complex of Genocide at Tsitsernakaberd in Yerevan on September 9 and laid a wreath in Memory of the Victims of the Armenian Genocide in the Ottoman Turkey in 1915.<sup>189</sup>

Very courageous was the behaviour of Ascar Akaev, president of Kirghizia. During his visit Azerbaijan as a President he announced in his address to the members of Milli Majlis, Parliament of Azerbaijan, that a genocide of the Armenians was committed in 1915 in the Ottoman Empire, arousing the Milli Majlis members' dissatisfaction<sup>190</sup>.

On January 30, 2014, in Praha, during the state visit of the president of the Republic of Armenia, the president of Czechia, Milosh Zeman in a press conference qualified the events of 1915, as "genocide"<sup>191</sup>, though the Republic of Czechia has not yet recognized the Armenian genocide until now.

There is also another example. Syria also has not officially recognized the Armenian genocide. But in an interview to the France Press Agency, president Bashar Asad accused Turkey for her brutal actions towards the Syrians, taking into account the criminal actions of Turks towards the Armenians and Syrian Christians in 1915, reminding about the Armenian Genocide, committed by the Young Turk leaders,

---

<sup>188</sup> Ն. Հովհաննիսյան, Այաթոլլահ Խոմենիի մոտեցումը Խորհրդային Միության հետ հարաբերությունները կարգավորելու հարցում և դիրքորոշումը Հայաստանի ու հայության հանդեպ»- «Հայաստան- Իրան. 20 տարի համագործակցության ճանապարհով»: Եր., 2012 էջ 74-75:

<sup>189</sup> International Affirmation and Recognition of the Armenian Genocide. Iran.  
[http://www.ourararat.com/eng/e\\_rec.htm](http://www.ourararat.com/eng/e_rec.htm)

<sup>190</sup> N.Hovhannisyan, Armenocide-a Recognized Genocide, p. 177-178.

<sup>191</sup> "Новое время", Ереван, 1 февраля 2014, с.2.

when 1,5 million innocent Armenians and 500 thousands Christians Syrians were killed.

Exclusively important was the opinion commissioned by the International Center for Transitional Justice. In February 2002 , it concluded that the Ottoman massacres of Armenians in 1915-1918 "included all of the elements of the crime of genocide as defined in the Genocide Convention, and legal scholars as well as historians, politicians, journalists and other people would be justified in continuing to so describe them".<sup>192</sup>

All these facts serve as a solid foundation for the adoption of a new conception on the Armenian Genocide as an Internationally recognized genocide.

---

<sup>192</sup> Recognition of the Armenian Genocide, [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Recognition\\_of\\_the\\_Armenian\\_Genocide](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Recognition_of_the_Armenian_Genocide)



#### **IV. RECOGNITION OF THE ARMENIAN GENOCIDE AT NONGOVERNMENTAL LEVEL**

The recognition of the Armenian Genocide at a level of different Nongovernmental Organizations - councils, committees, societies, associations and others, is also very essential. That process also has recorded significant achievements throughout the world. And it is impossible to speak about the largescale International recognition of the Armenian genocide without taking into account that process too. Nongovernmental organizations play a more and more important role in the contemporary world, not only in the field of public but also political, scientific, legal, cultural life, in the field of human rights and even in contemporary international relations. And the support of those organizations to the Armenian Cause and condemnation of Turkish denial of the Armenian Genocide, is one of the important factors in the genocide recognition phenomenon.

##### **1. The Armenian Genocide has been recognized by the World Peacesupporters Congress**

The Armenian Genocide has been recognized by numerous international organizations. Among them, we should mention the decisions of the World Congress of the Peacesupporters.

The year of 1965 became a turning point in the recognition of the Armenian Genocide. On April 24, 1965, a grandiose demonstration took place in Yerevan and other cities of Armenia, with the participants of more than one million men and women. In the vanguard of the movement, there were the Armenian intellectuals - scientists, writers, professors, teachers, artists, painters, students etc. As a result of that

impressive mass demonstration the wall of silence around the Armenian Genocide was crushed. One of the main demands of the demonstrators was the request to mark the 24th of April as the Remembrance Day of the Armenian Genocide. They also demanded recognition of the Armenian Genocide by Turkey and International community. The Armenian people took in their hands the initiative of the solution of all problems connected with the recognition of the Armenian Genocide. The end of the Era of Silence brought forth the Era of Recognition.

In 1965, the Armenian Genocide was recognized by the parliament of Uruguay. In that year, the Armenian Genocide was also recognized by such a mass organization as World Congress of Peacesupporters. It was indeed a world organization from the point of view of its territorial, geographic, ethnic, political, scientific and public significance. It united all peacelover forces of all continents, who, taking into account the bitter lessons of history, in particular the carnage of the First and Second World Wars, declared the defence of peace and prevention of wars the main tasks of all peoples and political forces. World Congress has its branches in all countries, including Armenia.

On July 15, 1965 in Helsinki, capital city of Finland, the Peace supporters World Congress was convened, which was an important event in International life. In its agenda was included also the question of the Armenian Genocide. The Congress officially recognized the Armenian Genocide, considering that tragedy of Armenians in 1915 in Ottoman Empire was genocide.<sup>193</sup> The Congress condemned the barbarian policy of the ottoman leaders for implementing the Armenian genocide, and the contemporary Turkish government for its denial to recognize the Armenian Genocide.

---

<sup>193</sup> N.Hovhannisyan, The Armenian Genocide . Armenocide-the Most Genocidal Genocide. In Ten Languages of the World, p. 572.

The World Congress of Peacesupporters was in fact one of the first nongovernmental organizations, which officially recognized the Armenian Genocide, stating that it had been the first genocide of XX century.<sup>194</sup>

The decision of the World Congress was a significant event which aroused great hopes among the Armenians in a positive solution of the recognition of the Armenian Genocide.

## **2. World Council of Churches and Recognition of the Armenian Genocide**

One of the most influential organizations of the contemporary world is World Council of Churches (WCC). It is a worldwide ecumenical organization, a fellowship of 349 Catholic, Orthodoxy, Protestant, Armenian Apostolic, Eastern Christian and other churches in more than 120 countries, representing and protecting religious interests of about 2 billion believers. In 1937 church leaders agreed to establish a World Council of Churches, but its official foundation was deferred by the beginning of the World War II until August 1948, when representatives of 147 churches assembled in Amsterdam to constitute the WCC.<sup>195</sup> It is seeking unity, a common witness and Christian service. It is not aimed at building a global "super-church", or standardizing styles of worship, but rather at deepening the fellowship of Christian churches and communities so they may see authentic

---

<sup>194</sup> Ibid.

<sup>195</sup> The WCC and ecumenical movement,  
[http://www.oikoumene.org/en/who\\_are\\_we/background.html](http://www.oikoumene.org/en/who_are_we/background.html)

expressions of the "one holy, catholic and apostolic church" in one another.<sup>196</sup>

The Assembly of the World Council of Churches usually discusses not only the religious and ecumenic questions, but also humanitarian problems, problems of struggle against violence, prevention of genocides.

On 24 July- 10 August 1983, was convened in Vancouver, Canada, VI Assembly of World Council of Churches. One of the main questions of its agenda was the question of the Armenian Genocide-Minutes on the Armenian Genocide.<sup>197</sup> It adopted several decisions, among them on the Armenian Genocide as well. In the Official Report on VI Assembly, it was recorded:

"1. During this assembly's discussion of violations of human rights our attention has been drawn to the historical reality and present threat of genocide of some peoples.

2. In this context we have been reminded once again of the tragic massacre of one-and-a-half million Armenians in Turkey and the deportation of another half million from this historic homeland at the beginning of this century. The silence of the world community and the deliberate efforts to deny even historical facts have been consistent sources of anguish and growing despair to the Armenian people, the Armenian churches and many others.

3. The Commission of the Churches on International Affairs of the World Council of Churches has raised this concern in the United Nations Commission on Human Rights with the reference to the latter's study of the Question of Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide.

---

<sup>196</sup> Ibid.

<sup>197</sup> World Council of Churches. Official Report VI Assembly World Council of Churches. Vancouver, Canada, 24 July-10 August 1983. 5.11 Minutes on Public Issues of Continuing Concern to the WWC. Minutes on the Armenian Genocide.

4. The Assembly requests the General Secretary to provide information to the churches on this, and to continue to pursue the matter in appropriate contexts. Public recognition of those events is essential in order that they do not continue to engender violent acts of retribution, and that through remembering the history of the Armenian people and other peoples might be spared a similar fate".<sup>198</sup>

The clear attitude of the World Council of Churches towards the Armenian Genocide, condemnation of silence around it and efforts of Turkey to deny the historical fact of the Armenian Genocide, was the reflection of the position of about two billions of christians of the world, and should be appreciated as great and mighty human and moral support to the Armenian people and serious contribution in the recognition of the Armenian genocide.

### **3. Young Men's Christian Association (YMCA) and recognition of the Armenian Genocide**

The next and oldest nongovernmental organization connected with the recognition of the Armenian Genocide is YMCA-Young Men's Christian Association, founded yet in 1844 in London. It is a worldwide movement with 45 million members from 124 federations affiliated through the World Alliance of YMCAs<sup>199</sup>. It is a federated organization made up of local and national organizations in voluntary association and is open to all, regardless of faith, social class, age and gender. The YMCA's main aim is putting Christian principles into practice, by developing "a healthy spirit, mind and body"<sup>200</sup>.

---

<sup>198</sup> Ibid.

<sup>199</sup> YMCA. <http://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/YMCA>

<sup>200</sup> Ibid.

From 14 to 20 July, 2002, the 15th Council of YMCA was convened in Oaxtepec, Mexico. In this meeting, the YMCA Council defined its attitude towards the Armenian Question, in particular its position to the recognition of the Armenian Genocide. On July 20, 2002, the Council of European Alliance of YMCAs adopted a Resolution on the Armenian Genocide. Here is the full text of that Resolution:

"In the course of the work with the Armenian YMCA, the European Alliance of YMCAs has developed a greater understanding of the trauma experienced by the Armenian people as a result of the continued indifference by much of the world to the genocide committed against them at the beginning of the 20th century.

As a Christian youth movement, the World Alliance of YMCAs believes that failure to acknowledge the injustice of the past contributes to their repetition in the future .

**With the convection, the World Alliance of YMCAs, assembled for World Council, July 2002 in Oaxtepec, Mexico, recognizes and condemns the genocide committed against the Armenian people and appeals to all National YMCA movements to similarly recognize and condemn it"**<sup>201</sup>.

The Resolution adopted by the Young Men's Christian Association as a document, in addition to the Resolution of the World Council of Churches' Resolution, helps to have a more complete picture of the position of the Christians of the World on the recognition of the Armenian Genocide. And it will make the recognition of the Armenian Genocide as Internationally recognized genocide more persuasive.

---

<sup>201</sup> Ibid.

#### **4. The Verdict of Permanent Peoples' Tribunal on the Armenian Genocide**

The Permanent Peoples' Tribunal is a Tribunal for International opinion and plays a significant role in the world legal system. Its position, actions, decisions and opinions usually are evaluated very highly by the International community.

Permanent Peoples' Tribunal (PPT) was founded in Bologna, Italy, on June 24, 1979, by the initiative of Senator Lelio Basso. Since its foundation, PPT has examined and adopted suitable Verdicts on the conflicts and genocidal cases in Eritrea, East Timor, Sahara, Argentina, Zaire, Guatemala, Salvador, Afghanistan, Philippine and other countries. This legal organization alongside with the mentioned cases, paid a very serious attention to the tragedy of the Armenians in the Ottoman Empire, to their killings and deportation in 1915, regarding those criminal actions as genocide.

Profoundly studying the history of the Armenians in different epoches, Tribunal came to a conclusion that the most horrible period of the Armenian history was the period of the Ottoman domination, when the Young Turk hangmen committed their main crime - genocide of the Armenians. And as it is recorded in the Permanent Peoples' Verdict on the Armenian Genocide, adopted on April 16, 1984, "In Eastern Anatolia, the Entire Armenian population had disappeared. A few survivors of the slaughter took refuge in Syria and Lebanon, while others reached Russian Armenia"<sup>202</sup>. It was also underlined that Verdict that "Every people has the right to exist. Every people has the right to retain peaceful possession of its territory and to return to it if it is expelled"<sup>203</sup>. But the Ottoman government, as is written in the Verdict of

---

<sup>202</sup> Permanent Peoples' Tribunal' April 16, 1984. Verdict of the Tribunal.

<sup>203</sup> Ibid.

PPT, has deprived the Armenians in Ottoman Empire from that right. The tribunal accused the Young Turks for their barbarious policy towards the Armenians. At the same time PPT condemned the Turkish government for their denial of the Armenian Genocide, stating that "Every government of the Turkish state since 1915 has refused to come to grips with the accusation of responsibility for the genocidal events"<sup>204</sup>. The Verdict noted and condemned the steps taken by Turk officials "when in recent international forums and academic meetings the Turkish govnrment has made a concerted effort to block enquiry or acknowledgement of the Armenian Genocide"<sup>205</sup>.

The PPT's Verdict is a conceptual evaluation of the Turkish Genocidal policy.

So the Verdict of the Permanent Peoples' Tribunal of 1984, together with the Ottoman court-martial Verdict of 1919, and Decision of the International Center for Transitional Justice of 2002, are the three main legal documents, allowing to resume that the Armenian Genocide is a legally recognized Genocide. It is like a mailed fist, striking on Turkish denial policy.

## **5. Nobel Laureates' Call for Armenian-Turkish Reconciliation on the base of Recognition of the Armenian Genocide by Turkey and Opening of the Border**

We interpreted the scientific aspect of the Recognition of the Armenian Genocide in connection with the letter of the International Association of Genocide Scholars' leaders to the Prime Minister of Turkey Erdogan, as well as in analysing other documents. But it is a

---

<sup>204</sup> Ibid

<sup>205</sup> Ibid.



very large and complicated problem and cannot be restricted by one document or one decision. There are many other valuable documents, famous scientific institutions and centers, which study the contemporary genocidal problems very seriously. And its evidence is the 53 Nobel Laureates' letter-address on the Armenian Genocide. It was prepared by the Humanism Foundation, headed by Holocaust survivor, Nobel Prize Laureate Elie Wiesel. The letter contains several very urgent problems. More than half hundreds of Nobel laureates from around the world "appealed to Armenia and Turkey to establish diplomatic relations unconditionally, open the border and, step up civil-society contacts"<sup>206</sup>. That open letter was released on April 9, 2007, and was signed, as was mentioned, by 53 world-famous, prominent academicians, writers, economists and scientists, who have won a Nobel prize in their respective fields in the last three decades. They are the pride of the modern scientific world. Among them is Holocaust survivor Elie Wiesel, Frederik de Klerk, the former South African president who presided over the collapse of apartheid in his country. **They "implicitly urged the Turkish government to acknowledge the 1915-18 mass killings and deportations of Armenians in the Ottoman Empire constituted genocide"**<sup>207</sup>. It is interesting to note that those Nobel Laureates "endorsed an independent 2003 study that concluded the slaughter of an estimated 1,5 million Ottoman Armenians fits into the internationally accepted definition of genocide"<sup>208</sup>. According to their opinion, "An open border would greatly improve the economic conditions for communities on both sides of border and enable the human interaction, which is essential for mutual understanding"<sup>209</sup>.

---

<sup>206</sup> Noble Laureates Call for Armenian-Turkish Reconciliation [http:// www. rferl .org/ content/article /1075779..html](http://www.rferl.org/content/article/1075779..html)

<sup>207</sup> Ibid.

<sup>208</sup> Ibid.

<sup>209</sup> Ibid.

The signatories said that the Turkish and Armenian governments should ease their lingering tensions "through additional treaty arrangements and full diplomatic relations" which they believe would facilitate bilateral academic links and student exchanges. On continuing their demands, the Noble Laureates called for the abolition of an article of the Turkish Penal Code which makes it a crime to "denigrate Turkishness" and has been used against dissident intellectuals questioning the official denial of the Armenian Genocide.

In the letter, it was also written that "Armenia also should reverse its own authoritarian course, allow free and fair elections, and respect the human rights"<sup>210</sup>.

The Nobel Laureates' letter is an unprecedented action, an important contribution in the process of recognition of the Armenian genocide, strengthening its scientific backgrounds and aspects, putting the Turkish genocide denial policy in a deadlock.

In conclusion, we have to mention that according to the definition of the Turkish Genocide scholar, professor Taner Akcam, declared by him in the Sixth Biennial Conference of International Association of the Genocide Scholars in Florida, in 2005, **"Turkey is the founder of the genocide denial industry"**.

## **6. The attitude of Human Rights Association of Turkey- "We bow down before the memory of the Armenian genocide victims»**

Human Rights Association (HRA) of Turkey was founded on July 17, 1986 by lawyers, journalists, intellectuals and relatives of political prisoners. It has 17,000 members, 34 branches in 81 provinces of Turkey. The Headquarter of HRA is in Ankara. More active are the

---

<sup>210</sup> Ibid.

branches in Istanbul, Diyarbakir and Izmir. Its high governing bodies are General Assembly and Board of 24 members<sup>211</sup>.

The Association acts in a country, where the political atmosphere is not favourable for that kind of organizations and activity. HRA constantly faces state intervention into its work, direct violence of individuals or national groups. HRA website claims 400 court cases against executives of the Association and its branches in Diyarbakir and Izmir, the governors of some provinces have ordered the closure of branches 30 times, the president of the HRA Akin Birdal has been sentenced to 20 months' imprisonment because of his speeches. And finally, HRA lists 14 members who were killed<sup>212</sup>.

In the center of HRA activity lie such demands as freedom of expression, general amnesty of prisoners, abolition of death penalty, state security courts and others<sup>213</sup>. And the problem of the Armenian Case, recognition of the Armenian Genocide and condemnation of the Armenian Genocide denial by the Turkish government is added to these problems. The April 24th, 2006, Press Release of the Istanbul branch of Human Rights Association and some ideas and conceptions reflected in that document are very interesting from this point of view.

It states: "Today, the 24th of April, is worldwide recognised as the date signifying the Armenian Genocide. But it is a taboo in Turkey. The Turkish state mobilises all its resources to deny the meaning of the date... At every occasion not only the Armenian Genocide, but also the great agony of the Armenian people is denied in Turkey and attempts

---

<sup>211</sup> Human Rights Association(Turkey) [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Human\\_Rights\\_Association\\_\(Turkey\)](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Human_Rights_Association_(Turkey))

<sup>212</sup> Ibid.

<sup>213</sup> Ibid.

are made to justify the genocide"<sup>214</sup>. Despite the Turkish administration's taboo, the human rights defenders in Istanbul decided to bow down before the memory of the Armenian victims of genocide. They considered that "Denial is a constituent part of the genocide itself and result of the continuation of the genocide. It deprives individuals of the right to mourn for their ancestors, the ethnic cleansing of their nation, the annihilation of people of all ages, all professions, all social sections, women, men children, babies, grandparents just because they were Armenians, regardless of their political background or conviction"<sup>215</sup>. The Turkish Human Rights defenders understood very well that Turkey's denial of the Armenian Genocide was not perspective and Turkey would have to radically change its approach to the Armenian Genocide sooner or later, to understand the pain of the Armenians and try to improve the relations with Armenia by recognizing the Armenian genocide. And they declared: "Today we, all the human rights defenders, would like to address all the Armenians in Turkey and elsewhere in the world and tell them **"we want to share the pain in your hearts and bow down before the memory of your lost ones. They are also our losses.** Our struggle for human rights in Turkey is at the same time our mourning for our common losses and homage paid to genocide victims"<sup>216</sup>. **And the main slogan of the Istanbul Branch of the Human Rights Association became-" NEVER AGAIN".**

Very wise words. They indicate that very interesting processes have been happening in Turkey in the last few years, a social strata has been formed capable to speak openly about the historical and internal

---

<sup>214</sup> Human Rights Association of Turkey , Istanbul Branch Press Release . 24th April 2006 . [http:// www. armenian-genocide.org/ Affirmation.362/ current\\_category.5/affirmation\\_d...](http://www.armenian-genocide.org/Affirmation.362/current_category.5/affirmation_d...)

<sup>215</sup> Ibid.

<sup>216</sup> Ibid.

problems, even about the very painful problems that have been under a taboo for a long period of time. That social strata consists mainly of intellectuals, writers, professors of the universities, publishers, journalists, as Ragip Zaraqolu, Ayshe, Murat Belge, Orkhan Pamouk, Taner Akcham and others, participants of the mass demonstrations in Istanbul and in other cities in memory of the editor of the Armenian newspaper "Agos" Hrant Dinq, killed in Istanbul by a Turkish terrorist. They were carrying placards with the words "today we are all Hrant Dinq", bravely demanding political changes, development of democracy, using the civil methods for the solution of such complicated problems as the recognition of the Armenian Genocide and accusation of the genocide denial policy, which is the official policy of contemporary Turkey.

On the base of these facts, we can speak about the processes of formation of a new political atmosphere in Turkey.

But it is necessary to be cautious and not exaggerate the significance of the mentioned tendencies.

Unfortunately, Turkey is still not ready to go till the end.

### X X X

The Armenian genocide has been recognised and condemned by other nongovernmental organizations too.

We have already elucidated in detail the position of International Association of Genocide Scholars in of recognition of the Armenian Genocide. So there is no need for reviewing its position again towards the recognition of the Armenian genocide .

For a long period, the Jewish Anti-Defamation League had been refusing to recognize the Armenian Genocide fearing of worsening

relations between Israel and Turkey, and was criticized for it , which finally made the leadership of the League change its position. On August 21, 2007, the Anti-Defamation League recognized the Armenian Genocide as "tantamount to genocide"<sup>217</sup>.

The Armenian genocide has been recognized by the Jerusalem Institute of Holocaust and Genocide, the Jerusalem Museum of Holocaust, the New York Institute of Genocide Study, Holocaust Museum in Washington, Union of the Jewish Congregation of America, and many other institutions, scientific-research centers and cultural establishments.

Essential contributions have been made by the American, English, German, French, Russian, Arabic and other mass media. "The New York Times", "Los Angeles Times" Associated Press, "The British Times", "Independent", French "Le Monde" and "Figaro", German "Spiegel", Russian "Izvestiya", Egyptian "Ruz al-Yusuf", Lebanese "Al-Safir", "Al-Nahar" and many others have officially recognized the Armenian Genocide. Their attitude was best expressed by the Editorial board of "The New York Times". By decision of its Editorial council in 2004, "The events of 1915 fall under the definition of "genocide" and when publishing articles over this subject the editorial staff will always use the word "genocide"<sup>218</sup>. It was mentioned in that article, that "The widespread killings of Armenians by the Ottoman Turkish government early in the 20th century incorrectly described the killings, in which 1.5 million Armenians died. The editorial of the Newspaper has made clear it was genocide, not a "massacre"<sup>219</sup>. "The New York Times" indicated that

---

<sup>217</sup> Recognition of the Armenian Genocide, [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Recognition\\_of\\_the\\_Armenian\\_Genocide](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Recognition_of_the_Armenian_Genocide)

<sup>218</sup> "The New York Times" 07.04. 2007: Events of 1915 were not "massacre", it was genocide.

<sup>219</sup> Ibid

the use of the definition "Armenian Genocide" has infuriated Turkey"<sup>220</sup>. And it is quite understandable, because Turkey is the founder of the "Genocide denial industry".

And the last but not the least. One of the distinguished Arab historians from Lebanon - Moussa Prince, author of several valuable books on the Armenian Genocide, by analogy with the term of "genocide" invented by Raphael Lemkin, invented a new term- **"Armenocide" for the definition of the Armenian Genocide**, stating that **"Armenocide is the most genocidal genocide"**<sup>221</sup>. And now the term of "Armenocide" is used together with the term of the "Armenian Genocide" by scholars and intellectuals for the First genocide committed in the Ottoman Empire

---

<sup>220</sup> Ibid.

<sup>221</sup> Moussa Prince, avec la collaboration de Marie-Ange Prince, Un genocide impuni. L'Armenocide, Heidelberg Press-Lebanon, 1967.

## **V. CONCLUSION**

### **THE ARMENIAN GENOCIDE-ARMENOCIDE IS AN INTERNATIONALLY RECOGNIZED GENOCIDE**

About 100 years have elapsed since the Armenian Genocide. In that period a great amount of official documents and materials have been accumulated in different languages of the world, as primary sources, official documents and materials. Many important decisions, resolutions, declarations by legislative, executive and legal bodies of many states, by different International organizations, scientific forums and congresses on the Armenian Genocide have been adopted. Among them the verdicts of courts and tribunals, affirming the historical fact of the Armenian genocide, condemning all of them who deny that historical truth, are very important. Exclusively important is the opinion and position of famous scientists, among them the point of view and conclusions of the Laureates of Nobel prize, decisions of Human Rights organizations, resolutions of the the World Council of Churches. During this period many serious academic studies on Armenian Great Tragedy were published in different countries of the world,- in Armenia, USA, Russia, Germany, France, Spain, Italy, Argentine, Uruguay, Lebanon, Syria, Egypt, Iran, Canada, Japan, Korea, Rumania, including memoirs of distinguished statesmen, genocide survivors etc. In mid-XX century a new scientific direction - genocidology and theory of genocide was formed due to which the study of genocide was transferred from the sentimental-emotional field into the scientific field and was raised at a new, high level, opening new perspectives for the evaluation of each genocidal action. The study of these very valuable sources and their analysis has proved the rightness of the Conclusion made by the International Association of Genocide Scholars that, firstly, "The Armenian Genocide is corroborated by the International scholarly, legal and human rights community" and secondly, "Not only Armenians



affirm the Armenian Genocide, but also it is the overwhelming opinion of genocide scholars", as it was recorded in the IAGS' leaders letter to the Turkish Prime-Minister.

The Armenian tragedy has been affirmed as genocide also by the decisions adopted at Institutional and Public levels, which is principally essential in this case.

**So the contemporary genocidology, its key conceptions, different facts, official documents and materials, resolutions, declarations etc., provide a very reliable background for conclusion and statement that the Armenian Genocide-Armenocide is already internationally recognized genocide.** It is an unrefutable truth like the Jewish Holocaust and all other genocides committed in Europe, Asia and Africa in XX-XXI centuries. So the problem of the Armenian Genocide from the problem of Armenian-Turkish relations became an international problem..

And now, after the corroboration of the Armenian Genocide-Armenocide by the international scholarly, legal and human rights community, begins a new phase-transition from the phase of recognition of the Armenian Genocide into the phase of compensation and liquidation of the heavy consequences of the Armenian Genocide, committed in the Ottoman Empire.

It is also in the interests of contemporary Turkey.